

For the attention of the Faber Shield Committee:

Re: Decision to dock Fulford B one point at the Faber Shield Meeting on Friday 2nd Oct

In August, Tom Wilson was nominated as a Fulford B player when Fulford selected their teams for the new season. However on Wednesday 9th September, Tom Wilson was selected for both Fulford teams on the same night. He played second for the A team against Malton A and seventh for the B team against Bootham A. On the night in question, both Fulford teams struggled for players with Fulford A playing Brian Smith (who was only at Fulford on the night to cook the buffet!) as the seventh player and Roger Gibson being called up late to represent Fulford B.

Prior to making the decision to select Tom Wilson for both sides, Richard Stroughair (Faber Shield Secretary) sought clarification of the rules from Colin Robinson (Faber Shield Chairman). The response was that it “was not technically against the rules but ethically wrong” in the opinion of the Chairman. This was relayed to Mike Walsh (Fulford A captain) and, given the lack of a better alternative, it was decided to select Tom Wilson for both sides.

Pages 5-6 of the Faber Shield Rules govern player eligibility and any restrictions on players. They clearly state the following, on which **we repeat** clarification was sought beforehand:-

*“A member having played **FIVE** times for a team in the snooker singles competition (the Carlsberg UK league) is ‘tied’ to that team for the remainder of the season. This means that he cannot play in later games for any other team in that competition.*

*A member may play in the Slater Cup (pairs) competition and then be promoted to a singles team but is not allowed to revert to the ‘C’ team after playing **FIVE** matches with the singles team.*

*Similarly a ‘B’ team player can play a maximum of **TWO** games for the ‘A’ team and still revert to the ‘B’ team”*

We are therefore of the opinion that no published Faber Shield rule was broken. The Faber Shield has operated a long-held practice of allowing rule changes to be made only at AGMs. We therefore question whether the decision of the Faber Shield Committee to effectively introduce a change to the rule retrospectively is legal. **It certainly sets a precedent that rules can be amended at any point, no longer allowing for the safeguards that an AGM provides.**

We understand that your decision was based on the fact that the rules do not explicitly state that the situation was allowable. However there are numerous examples of other situations not explicitly stated in the rules! You can only apply rules as to what they forbid – otherwise it is entirely at the whim of the committee to apply penalties as and when they see fit which is surely not equitable!

We appreciate your opinion that that this rule should be tightened up and certainly have no objection to doing so in the future. In fact, we agree with Malton A that it may be best if we change this rule so that a player is registered to play in only one team at the start of each season. However you cannot do this retrospectively; it can only be done at an AGM with the agreement of the majority of the member clubs.

Fulford club therefore wish to appeal the decision to penalise Fulford B one point and furthermore believe that both the original results involving Tom Wilson should stand with no penalties being applied to either Fulford team.

To summarise our points in relation to this matter:-

- No published Faber Shield Rule was broken at the time of the matter in question
- Clarification of the existing rules was sought prior to the decision to select Tom Wilson for both sides
- The Faber Shield AGM is the correct forum for rule changes, therefore no rules can retrospectively be adopted
- Should the original decision be upheld, the Faber Shield would be setting a dangerous precedent which devalues the integrity of the Faber Shield rules and allows rules to be changed or introduced at any point in time.

Yours Sincerely,

Three handwritten signatures in black ink. The first signature is 'A Reed', the second is 'N. Smith', and the third is 'M Walsh'. Each signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Fulford Conservative Club

Alan Reed (Fulford Faber Shield Representative), Nigel Smith (Fulford 'B' Captain) and Mike Walsh (Fulford 'A' Captain)